

## Evaluating Closed-List Proportional Representation System and Its Compatibility in Contemporary Indonesian Election

**Authors :** Ridho Al-Hamdi, Sakir, Tanto Lailam

**Abstract :** During the democratic period of 1999-present, Indonesia has consistently applied a List Proportional Representation (List PR) system in the parliamentary election. Between 1999 and 2004, it adopted a closed-list proportional representation (CLPR) system. In the meantime, it employed open-list proportional representation (OLPR) system from 2009 to 2019. Recently, some parties intended to propose the application of CLPR while others are still consistent in adopting OLPR. An unfinished debate is taking place. Thus, this article aims to evaluate the application of CLPR in Indonesia and, in turn, analyze its compatibility in contemporary parliamentary election system. From a methodological standpoint, it is qualitative research by applying a case study approach. Data-gathering relies on field data, mainly focus group discussion (FGD) and in-depth interviews with political parties, electoral management bodies (EMBs), NGO activists, and scholars spread in six provinces and nine regencies/cities across the country. Using SWOT analysis and the compatibility of CLPR and embedded democracy framework, the finding demonstrates that CLPR is no longer relevant for contemporary Indonesian elections. This paper recommends OLPR by considering that CLPR has numerous weaknesses and threats that can jeopardize embedded democracy. More importantly, CLPR can remove inclusive suffrage significantly.

**Keywords :** closed-list proportional representation, embedded democracy, Indonesia, parliamentary election

**Conference Title :** ICEEL 2021 : International Conference on Elections and Election Law

**Conference Location :** Lisbon, Portugal

**Conference Dates :** October 28-29, 2021