# The Algorithm to Solve the Extend General Malfatti's Problem in a Convex Circular Triangle 

Ching-Shoei Chiang


#### Abstract

The Malfatti's problem solves the problem of fitting three circles into a right triangle such that these three circles are tangent to each other, and each circle is also tangent to a pair of the triangle's sides. This problem has been extended to any triangle (called general Malfatti's problem). Furthermore, the problem has been extended to have $1+2+\ldots+\mathrm{n}$ circles inside the triangle with special tangency properties among circles and triangle sides; it is called the extended general Malfatti's problem. In the extended general Malfatti's problem, call it $\operatorname{Tri}\left(T_{n}\right)$, where $T_{n}$ is the triangle number, there are closed-form solutions for the $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{1}\right)$ (inscribed circle) problem and $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{2}\right)$ (3 Malfatti's circles) problem. These problems become more complex when n is greater than 2 . In solving the $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problem, $\mathrm{n}>$ 2 , algorithms have been proposed to solve these problems numerically. With a similar idea, this paper proposed an algorithm to find the radii of circles with the same tangency properties. Instead of the boundary of the triangle being a straight line, we use a convex circular arc as the boundary and try to find $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ circles inside this convex circular triangle with the same tangency properties among circles and boundary as in $\operatorname{Tri}\left(T_{n}\right)$ problems. We call these problems the $\operatorname{Carc}\left(T_{n}\right)$ problems. The algorithm is a $\mathrm{mO}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ algorithm, where m is the number of iterations in the loop. It takes less than 1000 iterations and less than 1 second for the $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{16}\right)$ problem, which finds 136 circles inside a convex circular triangle with specified tangency properties. This algorithm gives a solution for circle packing problem inside convex circular triangle with arbitrarily-sized circles. Many applications concerning circle packing may come from the result of the algorithm, such as logo design, architecture design, etc.


Keywords-Circle packing, computer-aided geometric design, geometric constraint solver, Malfatti's problem.

## I. Introduction

IN this paper, we would like to propose an algorithm to find one, three, six, ten, ..., all triangle numbers, with special tangency properties among these circles. Moreover, these circles are situated within a convex region enclosed by three circular arcs, and they are tangent to the boundary circular arc as indicated. Before we illustrate the problem, we introduce the related topics including the extended Malfatti's problem inside a triangle in this section.

Given a triangle, we want to find three circles inside the triangle, these circles tangent to each other, and every two circles tangent to one edge of the given triangle, this problem is called the Malfatti's problem. The problem generalized to any triangle is called the general Malfatti's problem. An instance of this general Malfatti's problem is shown in Fig. 1 [5]. And, these three circles are called the Malfatti circles.

[^0]

Fig. 1 Malfatti's problem
There are several known solutions of Malfatti's problem. Fukagawa and Pedoe [1] mentioned that the general Malfatti's problem on an arbitrary triangle was actually formulated and solved by Chokuen Ajima. The interested reader is referred to [2]-[4] for a history of the problem and an explanation of various solutions and generalizations.
Before extending the Malfatti's problem to involve more than three circles within the triangle, we require a more detailed specification of the tangency relationships among these circles and the sides of the triangle.

The triangle number $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ counts objects arranged in the following way: The first triangle number $\mathrm{T}_{1}$ is one, represented by a dot, as shown in Fig. 2 (a). The n-th triangle number Tn has the form that $\mathrm{Tn}-1$ on top, and following by one more row with n objects, as shown in Figs. 2 (b)-(d). $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ can be easily derived as $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}=1+2+3 \ldots+\mathrm{n}=\mathrm{n}(\mathrm{n}+1) / 2$, where $\mathrm{n}=1,2$, $3, \ldots$


Fig. 2 Triangle number
The general Malfatti's problem involves finding three circles for any given triangle. We aim to extend this problem to include more than three circles. Instead of three circles, we extend the number of circles from 3 to $T_{n}$, where $n=1,2,3, \ldots$, with tangency properties among circles and edge of triangles. When we consider $T_{n}$ circles problem, it is called the $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problem, means the problem with $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ circles inside a triangle (see Fig. 3 for $\mathrm{n}=2,4,31$ ).

[^1]
(a) $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{2}\right)$

(b) $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{4}\right)$

(c) $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{31}\right)$

Fig. 3 Extended General Malfatti's Problem $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$
We consider the dots in Fig. 2 are vertices in a graph, we want to add edges to construct a special class of graph. The $T_{2}$ $(\mathrm{n}=2)$ case in Fig. 2 (b) has three vertices, we add edges pairwise for these three vertices, as shown in Fig. 3 (b). There are only two rows, and one edge connect two vertices in the second row, and two edges connect the only one vertex in the first row with two vertices in the second rows. The $T_{3}$ cases in Fig. 2 have three rows, we use the same way to add edges for the first and second rows, and add edges for the second rows with the third row. There are two vertices in the second rows, and three vertices in the third rows. The first vertex at the second row connects to the first and second vertices at the third row and the second vertex at the second row connects to the second and third vertices at the third row. We can use the same approach to add the edges form $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ cases to $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}+1}$ cases similarly. The graph for $T_{1}$ to $T_{6}$ cases is shown in Fig. 3. We call this graph a triangle graph for $T_{n}$. We notice that $T_{n}=T_{n-1}+n, T_{1}=$ 1 or $\mathrm{Tn}=\mathrm{n}(\mathrm{n}+1) / 2$, which is the vertices number of the triangle graph for $T_{n}$. The number of edges for the triangle graph for $T_{n}$, denoted $E_{n}$, is $E_{n}=E_{n-1}+3(n-1), E_{1}=0$ or $E n=3 n(n-1) / 2$.

We consider the triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$, every dot represents a circle, and edge connecting two dots means these two circles are externally tangent to each other. We assume the triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ is inside a triangle, we want to specify the tangency properties for triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ and three sides of the triangle. We consider triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{1}$ inside a triangle, it represents a dot(circle) inside a triangle, as shown in Fig. 4 (a). In this graph, there is a circle V inside the triangle, the edge connects V and perpendicular to $\overline{A B}$ means that circle V tangent to $\overline{A B}$ side of the triangle. So, the problem in Fig. 4 (a) indicates the problem of finding the inscribed circle of a triangle. When we change this graph from $T_{1}$ to $T_{2}$ inside the triangle, see Fig. 4 (b), we want to find three circles (represents by three dots $\mathrm{V}_{1}$, $V_{2}, V_{3}$ ), these three circles tangency to each other represented by the edge connect these three vertices, and the circle $\mathrm{V}_{1}$ tangents to edge $\overline{A B}$ and $\overline{B C}$, the circle $\mathrm{V}_{2}$ tangents to edge $\overline{A B}$ and $\overline{A C}$, the circle $\mathrm{V}_{3}$ tangents to edge $\overline{A C}$ and $\overline{B C}$. This is the malfatti's Problem. We can extend the problem, so that the graph inside the triangle from triangle graph for $T_{n}$ to triangle graph for $T_{n+1}$, we established a problem from the circle number
equal the triangle number $T_{n}$. to the circle number equal to $T_{n+1}$.


Fig. 4 Tangency graph for Tri(Tn)
We call these graphs, which connect the triangle graph with triangle edges, a tangency graph for $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$. This tangency graph has a triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ inside the triangle and we need to add edges to specified the tangency property for circles, represented by dots in triangle graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$, with sides of triangle. The tangency graph for $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{3}\right)$ and $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{4}\right)$ are shown in Figs. 4 (c) and (d). We classified these circles (represented by dots in a triangle) into three categories: corner circles, edge circles and inner circles. The circle at the first row (represented by dots in triangle graph), the first and last circle at the last rows are called the corner circles, and the corner circles always tangent to two side of the triangle. The first and the last circles for the second to ( $\mathrm{n}-1$ ) rows and the circles except the first and last circles in the last row are called the boundary circle, it is always tangent to one side of the triangle. The remainder circles are called the inner circles, which are not tangent to sides of the triangle. It is worth noting that all of these problems involve corner circles, and in cases where n is equal to or greater than 3 , boundary circles are also included. And, the first inner circle starts from $n=4$. The results [5], [6] of the $\operatorname{Tri}\left(T_{n}\right), n=2,4,31$ problems are presented in Figs. 3 (a)-(c), respectively.

## II. Problem Statement

A circle divides an area into two parts, inside and outside of the circles. The inside region contains the center of the circle. For every circular arc, we call the "center side" of the arc the convex side of the circular arc (convex circular arc in short), and the other side the concave circular arc. This paper tries to find algorithms to solve similar problems for $\operatorname{Tri}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$, except that the area bounded the tangency graph for $\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}$ is not a triangle but a convex circular triangle. We call these problems $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problems. The tangency graphs for $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ are shown in Fig. 5. These graphs are similar to the tangency graph for $\operatorname{Tri}\left(T_{n}\right)$, as shown in Fig. 4. They have the same triangle graph for $T_{n}$, with
a similar approach to connect the tangency properties between triangle graph and (convex circular) triangle edges.

(a) $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{1}\right)$

(c) $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{3}\right)$

(b) $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{2}\right)$

(d) $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{4}\right)$

Fig. 5 The $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problems
The $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problems become more complex compared to $\mathrm{Tri}(\mathrm{Tn})$ problem, because the sides of the bounded region change from straight line to convex circular arc. We need more theorem and new algorithms to solve these tangency problems. These theorem and algorithms will be introduced in Sections III and IV. The experimental results will be shown in Section V.

## III. Theorem and Algorithm

In the algorithm we propose later, we give an initial set of radii for the circles, and enlarge/reduce its radius by its relation with its neighbors. In this process, we need to compute angles for different situation. We consider Fig. 5 (b), the center of the circle represented by dot $\mathrm{V}_{1}$ emits four vectors to its neighbors, including the vectors to the center of circles represented by $\mathrm{V}_{2}$, and $\mathrm{V}_{3}$, projection point on boundary Carc $\widehat{B C}$ and boundary Carc $\widehat{A B}$. These four vectors produce four angles, and the sum of these four angles should equal to $2 \pi$. From the current radii of $\mathrm{V}_{2}$ and $\mathrm{V}_{3}$, and information form $\widehat{B C}$ and $\widehat{A B}$, the sum of these four angles is greater than (less than) $2 \pi$, we need to enlarge (reduce) the radius of circle $V_{1}$.

Now, we need to consider different criteria of angle computation. We consider three different kinds of circles inside three Carc, there are corner circles, boundary circles and inner circles, as shown in Fig. 6. We consider the inner circles, see Fig. 6 (c), we need to compute the angle $\alpha_{i}, i=1,2,3,4,5,6$. We consider the boundary circles, as shown in Fig. 6 (b), the way to compute $\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{3}, \alpha_{4}$ is the same as we compute angle for inner circles, we need a way to compute $\alpha_{1}$ and $\alpha_{5}$ here. In the corner circle case, as shown in Fig. 6 (a), we need to find a way to find



Fig. 6 Different circles in convex circular triangle
Let us denote the circle centered at $\mathrm{v}=(\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{y})$ with radius r as $\mathrm{C}(\mathrm{v}, \mathrm{r})$, we have the following three theorems:
Theorem1. Consider three circles $\mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{C}_{1}, \mathrm{r}_{1}\right), \mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{C}_{2}, \mathrm{r}_{2}\right)$ and $\mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{C}_{3}, \mathrm{r}_{3}\right)$ tangent to each other externally, as shown in Fig. 7, then the angle $\angle \mathrm{C}_{3} \mathrm{C}_{1} \mathrm{C}_{2}=\varphi$ is:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\varphi=\cos ^{-1} \frac{\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right) r_{1}+\left(r_{1}-r_{2}\right) r_{3}}{\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right)\left(r_{1}+r_{3}\right)} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. We know the length of the triangle sides are $r_{1}+r_{2}, r_{1}+r_{3}$
and $r_{2}+r_{1}$, so the angle can be computed by the cosine theorem.


Fig. 7 Angle computation for inner circle
Theorem2. Consider two circle $\mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{C}_{1}, \mathrm{r}_{1}\right)$ and $\mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{C}_{2}, \mathrm{r}_{2}\right)$ tangent to each other externally, and these two circles' tangents to $\mathrm{C}\left(\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{a}}\right.$, $\mathrm{r}_{\mathrm{a}}$ internally, as shown in Fig. 8, then the angle the angle $\beta$ and $\gamma$ are equal to:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \beta=\cos ^{-1} \frac{\left(r_{1}-r_{2}\right) r_{a}-\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right) r_{1}}{\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right)\left(r_{a}-r_{1}\right)}  \tag{2}\\
& \gamma=\cos ^{-1} \frac{r_{a}^{2}-\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right) r_{a}-r_{1} r_{2}}{r_{a}^{2}-\left(r_{1}+r_{2}\right) r_{a}+r_{1} r_{2}} \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

Proof. Consider the triangle whose vertices are $\mathrm{C}_{1}, \mathrm{C}_{2}$, and $\mathrm{C}_{3}$. The side length for the triangle is $r_{1}+r_{2}, r_{a}-r_{1}, r_{a}-r_{2}$, so we can find three angles for this triangle. $\beta$ and $\gamma$ can be computed by $\beta=\pi-\angle \mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{A}} \mathrm{C}_{1} \mathrm{C}_{2}, \gamma=\pi-\angle \mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{A}} \mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{C}_{1}$.


Fig. 8 Angle computation for boundary circle
Theorem3. Consider two circles $C\left(v_{a}, r_{a}\right)$ and $\left.C\left(v_{b}, r_{b}\right)\right)$, intersect at two points, we call one of these two points C , there is a circle tangent to these two circular Carc from the convex side center v and radius r , as shown in Fig. 9, then the angle $\alpha$ is equal to:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\alpha=\cos ^{-1} \frac{\left(r_{a}-r\right)^{2}+\left(r_{b}-r\right)^{2}-\left\|\overline{v_{a} v_{b}}\right\|^{2}}{2\left(r_{a}-r\right)\left(r_{b}-r\right)} \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. Consider the triangle whose vertices are $\mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{a}}, \mathrm{v}_{\mathrm{b}}$ and c , their side lengths are $\overline{v_{a}} v_{b}, r_{a}-\mathrm{r}, \mathrm{r}_{\mathrm{b}} \mathrm{r}$. So, the angle $\alpha=\angle \mathrm{V}_{\mathrm{a}} \mathrm{Vv}_{\mathrm{b}}$ can be found by the cosine theorem.


Fig. 9 Angle computation for corner circle
By knowing the radii for every circle C , we consider all vectors from its circle center to its neighbors' circle centers, or to the projection point on boundary circular arc. After sorting these vectors in order, we can compute every angle between two vectors via Theorem 1 to Theorem 3. We sum up all this angles, call it $\mathrm{TA}(\mathrm{C})$, and judge the enlarge/reduce the radius of this circle C. Using this idea, we have the following algorithm:

Algorithm:

1. Input information for three circles $v_{a}, r_{a}, v_{b}, r_{b}, v_{c}, r_{c}$, and $n$.
2. Enumerate circles, set initial radius $r_{i}=1 /(n+1)$, where $i=$ $1,2, \ldots, \mathrm{~T}_{\mathrm{n}}$.
3. Compute $\mathrm{TA}\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)$ for all circles.
4. While one of $\mathrm{TA}\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}\right.$, $)$ is not equal $2 \pi$ (within a tolerance). 4.1 Calculate the enlarge/reduce amount for the radius of $\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}$, (enlarge or reduce) if sumangle $\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}, \mathrm{j}}\right)>2 \pi$ (or $<2 \pi$ ). 4.2 Enlarge/reduce all radii in the same time.
4.3 Enlarge/reduce so that the result figures fit in the region bounded by three convex Carc.
4.4 Compute $\mathrm{TA}\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)$ for all circles.
5. Draw the result.

At first (step 1), we can find three convex Carc from the three circles, and find the associated three vertices from the intersection point of any pairs of circular arc. From the input integer $\mathrm{n}(\mathrm{n}>1)$, we can generate information (radii) for circles for all $T_{n}$ circles (step 2). Then we compute $T A\left(C_{i}\right)$ (by using Theorem 1 to 3 ) for all circles (step 3 ). We use a while loop (step 3) to repeat many iterations until all circles have the properties $\mathrm{TA}\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)=2 \pi$. Inside the while loop, the radii of all circles have been enlarged/reduced, depending on their $\mathrm{TA}\left(\mathrm{C}_{\mathrm{i}}\right)$. After that, we give one more constraint to enlarge/reduce the radii of all circles with one common ratio, so that this group circles fit into the convex region bounded by three Carc (step 4.3). After the end of the while loop, the only thing left is the display of the result.

## IV. IMPLEMENT AND EXAMPLES

We use Python 3 to implement the above algorithm in a PC (Intel Core i7-10750H CPU), and test for the problem $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$, $\mathrm{n}=1,2,3,4,8,16, \ldots$ for the convex area inside three circles $\mathrm{C}((11,0), 15.9612), \quad \mathrm{C}((12.72,12.69), 18.5) \quad$ and $\mathrm{C}((-$ $1.3,7.65), 16.1327)$. The results are shown in Fig. 10 and the circle information in Table I.

In Table I, the first column indicates the value n for $\operatorname{Carc}(\mathrm{n})$ problem, the second column is the execution time (seconds) for

## V. Conclusion and Future Research

$\operatorname{The} \operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right), \mathrm{n} \geq 1$, problem can be constructed in the proposed algorithm in this paper. It seems that the range of the radius for a boundary circle is wider than the range of the radius for the inner circle. The CPU time is mainly used for displaying the figure, as the computation for the $\operatorname{Carc}(\mathrm{T} 1)$ problem using an $\mathrm{O}(1)$ algorithm takes almost the same time compared to the others. We proposed the algorithm to solve $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$. The boundary convex arc is a circular arc, which represents a curve of degree 2 . This problem can be easily extended to concave Carc. There are many different types and/or different degree of boundary curve, such as Bezier curve, which can be further investigated.

## Acknowledgment

Thanks to Min-Hsuan Hsiung, Fan-Ming Chiu, Hung-Chieh Li, Guan Wen Wang and Hsi Wen Wang for their assistance to implement the algorithm of this paper.

## References

[1] Fukagawa, H. and Pedoe, D. "The Malfatti Problem." Japanese Temple Geometry Problems (San Gaku). Winnipeg: The Charles Babbage Research Centre, pp. 28 and 103-106, 1989.
[2] O. Bottema, "The Malfatti Problem," Forum Geometricorum 1, 43-50, 2000.
[3] M. Stefanović. "Triangel centers associated with the Malfatti circles." Forum Geometricorum 3,83-93, 2003.
[4] Wolfram MathWorld. "Malfatti Circles," http://mathworld.wolfram.com/MalfattiCircles.html
[5] Ching-Shoei Chiang, Christoph M. Hoffmann, Paul Rosen, "A gereralized Malfatti's Problem", Computational Geometry, Volume 45, Issue 8, October 2012, pages 425-435.
[6] Ching-Shoei Chiang, Hung Chieh Li, Min-Hsuan Hsiung, and Fan-Ming Chiu, "Extended General Malfatti's Problem, The 19th International Conference on Scientific Computing, 2021/7/26-29. associated problem. The third column is the number of iterations in the while loop of the proposed algorithm. There are only corner circles for $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{1}\right)$ and $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{2}\right)$ cases, and it starts to have inner circles from $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{4}\right)$. There are three corner circles for all $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right)$ problem, and column four indicates the radii for these three circles. The fifth column to sixth column indicate the radius or radii range for boundary and inner circles in the $\operatorname{Carc}\left(\mathrm{T}_{\mathrm{n}}\right), \mathrm{n}=3,4,8$ problems.


[^0]:    Ching-Shoei Chiang is with the Department of Computer Science and Information Management, Soochow University, Taipei 100, Taiwan (phone: +886-2-23111531 ext. 3801; fax: +886-2-23756878, e-mail:

[^1]:    chiang@gm.scu.edu.tw).
    The research of this paper is supported by MOST (Ministry of Science and Technology, Taiwan) grant MOST-111-2221-E-031-005.

